

# Instructional Review Rubric

## Appendix A

A NAEP Proficiency Level provides information about what a student *should* know and be able to do within a given subject area. NAEP items that illustrate various achievement levels are selected on the basis of probability estimates of student performance for a given item who score within established score-scale ranges. For the purpose of this classification exercise, assigning questions into one of three proficiency levels is to be approximated by understanding and projecting the meaning of the Proficiency Level descriptions, rather than through a NAEP-style statistical analysis.

**Basic Level Assignments and Questions focus on the two lowest levels of Bloom's Taxonomy.** Students Recall facts, make simple inferences or interpretations, demonstrate a rudimentary understanding of terminology, principles, and concepts that underlie the field, and able to make only direct connections between content and personal experience. Basic level work requires students to:

- identify some parts of physical and biological systems,
- recognize relationships presented in verbal, algebraic, tabular, and graphical forms, and
- answer who, what, where and when types of questions.

Assignments that require students to remember information or make simple explanations are at the basic level.

**Proficient Level Assignments and Questions focus on the two middle levels of Bloom's Taxonomy.** Students are required to use of analytical skills, draw reasonable conclusions, make appropriate conjectures or inferences by applying logical reasoning on the basis of partial or incomplete information. Proficiency requires students to:

- defend ideas, and to give supporting examples,
- understand of algebraic, statistical, and geometric and spatial reasoning that is relevant to the field,
- application of scientific and technical principles to everyday situations, and
- judge and defend the reasonableness of answers or solutions to problems that routinely occur in the chosen technical field.

Proficient level questions and assignments require students to apply and analyze information learned.

**Advanced Level Assignments and Questions focus on the two highest levels of Bloom's Taxonomy.** Students formulate of generalizations, the synthesis of ideas, and the creation of models through probing examples and counterexamples. Advanced level work requires students to:

- communicate their ideas and reasoning through the correct use of concepts, symbolism, and logical thinking,
- design and apply procedures to test or solve complex, real-world situations, and thorough, thoughtful, and extensive written responses.

Advanced level questions and assignments require students to evaluate and create work.

**The attached rubric provides leaders with each of the following:**

- **The three NAEP levels**
- **The old and new Bloom's Taxonomy levels**
- **Sample verbs used for that level of questions**
- **Sample question stems**
- **Potential assignments**

**Leaders should not consider this an all inclusive group and will have to make judgments as to the appropriate level based upon the examples provided.**

DRAFT

			<b>USEFUL VERBS</b>	<b>SAMPLE QUESTION STEMS FOR ASSESMENTS</b>	<b>POTENTIAL ASSIGNMENTS AND PRODUCTS</b>
<b>B A S I C</b>	<b>K</b>	<b>R</b>	<b>tell</b>	What happened after...?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>List the story's main events</li> <li>Make timeline of events.</li> <li>Make a facts chart.</li> <li>List any pieces of information you can remember.</li> <li>Recite a poem.</li> <li>List all the animals in the story.</li> <li>Make a chart showing...</li> <li>Remember an idea or fact</li> <li>Question and answer sessions</li> <li>Workbooks and worksheets</li> <li>Remember things read, heard, saw</li> <li>Information searches</li> <li>Reading Assignments</li> <li>Drill and practice</li> <li>Finding definitions</li> <li>Memory games Quizzes</li> <li>Forming relationships (analogies, similes)</li> <li>Predicting effects of changes</li> <li>Dramatization</li> <li>Peer teaching Show and tell</li> <li>Estimating</li> <li>Story problems</li> <li>Cut out or draw pictures to show a particular event</li> <li>Illustrate the main idea.</li> <li>Make a cartoon strip showing the sequence of events.</li> <li>Write and perform a play based on the story.</li> <li>Retell the story in your own words.</li> <li>Paint a picture of some aspect of the story you like.</li> <li>Write a summary of the event.</li> <li>Prepare a flow chart to illustrate the sequence of events.</li> </ul>
	<b>N</b>	<b>E</b>	<b>list</b>	How many...?	
	<b>O</b>	<b>M</b>	<b>describe</b>	Who was it that...?	
	<b>W</b>	<b>E</b>	<b>relate</b>	Name the...?	
	<b>L</b>	<b>M</b>	<b>locate</b>	Describe what happened at...	
	<b>E</b>	<b>B</b>	<b>write</b>	Who spoke to...?	
	<b>D</b>	<b>E</b>	<b>find</b>	Tell me why...?	
	<b>G</b>	<b>R</b>	<b>state</b>	Find the meaning of...?	
	<b>E</b>	<b>I</b>	<b>name</b>	What is it...? Which is true or false...?	
	<b>N</b>				
	<b>G</b>				
	<b>C</b>	<b>E</b>	<b>explain</b>	Write in your own words...?	
	<b>O</b>	<b>X</b>	<b>interpret</b>	Write a brief outline...	
	<b>M</b>	<b>P</b>	<b>outline</b>	What do you think could have happened next...?	
	<b>P</b>	<b>L</b>	<b>discuss</b>		
<b>I C</b>	<b>R</b>	<b>A</b>	<b>distinguish</b>	Who do you think...?	
	<b>E</b>	<b>I</b>	<b>predict</b>	What was the main idea?	
	<b>H</b>	<b>N</b>	<b>restate</b>	Who was the main character?	
	<b>E</b>	<b>I</b>	<b>translate</b>	Distinguish between...?	
	<b>N</b>	<b>N</b>	<b>compare</b>	What differences exist between...?	
	<b>S</b>	<b>G</b>	<b>describe</b>	Provide an example of what you mean by...?	
	<b>I</b>			Provide a definition for...?	
	<b>O</b>				
	<b>N</b>				
			<b>USEFUL VERBS</b>	<b>SAMPLE QUESTION STEMS FOR ASSESMENTS</b>	<b>POTENTIAL ASSIGNMENTS AND PRODUCTS</b>

P R O F I C I E N T	A P P L I C A T I O N	A P P L Y I N G	<b>solve</b> <b>show</b> <b>use</b> <b>illustrate</b> <b>calculate</b> <b>construct</b> <b>complete</b> <b>examine</b> <b>classify</b>	Do you know another instance where...? Could this have happened in...? Group by characteristics such as...? What factors would change if...? Apply the method used to some experience of your own...? What questions would you ask of...? From the information given, develop a set of instructions about...? Would this information be useful if you had a...?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Construct a model to demonstrate how it will work.</li> <li>• Make a diorama to illustrate an important event.</li> <li>• Compose a book about...</li> <li>• Make a scrapbook about the areas of study.</li> <li>• Make a paper-mache map showing information</li> <li>• Make a puzzle game using ideas from the study area.</li> <li>• Make a clay model of...</li> <li>• Paint a mural.</li> <li>• Design a market strategy for your product.</li> <li>• Design an ethnic costume.</li> <li>• Use knowledge from various areas to find solutions</li> <li>• Role playing/role reversal</li> <li>• Producing a newspaper, stories, etc.</li> <li>• Interviews</li> <li>• Experiments</li> <li>• Solving problems by use of known information</li> <li>• Practical applications of learned knowledge</li> <li>• Design a questionnaire to gather information.</li> <li>• Make a flow chart to show critical stages.</li> <li>• Write a commercial for a new / familiar product.</li> <li>• Review a work of art in terms of form, color, and texture.</li> <li>• Construct a graph to illustrate selected information.</li> <li>• Uncover unique characteristics</li> <li>• Distinguish between facts and inferences</li> <li>• Evaluate the relevancy of data</li> <li>• Recognize logical fallacies in reasoning</li> <li>• Recognize unstated assumptions</li> <li>• Analyze the structure of a work of art, music or writing</li> <li>• Compare and contrast</li> <li>• Construct a jigsaw puzzle.</li> <li>• Analyze a family tree showing relationships.</li> </ul>
	A N A L Y S I S	A N A L Y Z I N G	<b>analyze</b> <b>distinguish</b> <b>examine</b> <b>compare</b> <b>contrast</b> <b>investigate</b> <b>categorize</b> <b>identify</b> <b>explain</b> <b>separate</b> <b>advertise</b>	Which event could not have happened if...? If...happened, what might the ending have been? How was this similar to...? What was the underlying theme of...? What do you see as other possible outcomes? Why did...changes occur? Compare your...with that presented in...? What must have happened when...? How is...similar to...? What are some of the problems of...? What was the turning point in the story? What was the problem with...?	
			<b>USEFUL VERBS</b>	<b>SAMPLE QUESTION STEMS FOR ASSESMENTS</b>	<b>POTENTIAL ASSIGNMENTS AND PRODUCTS</b>

A D V A N C E D	S Y N T H E S I S	C R E A T E	<b>create</b> <b>invent</b> <b>compose</b> <b>predict</b> <b>plan</b> <b>construct</b> <b>design</b> <b>imagine</b> <b>improve</b> <b>propose</b> <b>devise</b> <b>formulate</b>	Design a...to...? What is a possible solution to...? What would happen if...? If you had access to all resources, how would you deal with...? How would you design your own way to...? How many ways can you...? Create new and unusual uses for...? Develop a proposal which would...? How would you compose a song about...? Write a new recipe for a tasty dish? Is there a better solution to...? Judge the value of... Defend your position about... Do you think...is a good or bad thing? Explain How would you have handled...? What changes to...would you recommend? Are you a...person? Why? How would you feel if...? How effective are...?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Invent a machine to do a specific task.</li><li>• Design a building.</li><li>• Create a new product. Give it a name and plan a marketing campaign.</li><li>• Write your feelings in relation to...</li><li>• Write a TV show, play, puppet show, role-play, song, or pantomime about...</li><li>• Design a record, book, or magazine cover for...</li><li>• Create a language code.</li><li>• Sell an idea to a billionaire.</li><li>• Compose a rhythm or put new words to a known melody.</li><li>• Hypothesize</li><li>• Write a creative story, poem or song</li><li>• Propose a plan for an experiment</li><li>• Integrate the learning from different areas into a plan for solving a problem</li><li>• Formulate the new scheme for classifying objects</li><li>• Show how an idea or product might be changed</li><li>• Prepare a list of criteria to judge a...show.</li><li>• Conduct a debate about an area of special interest.</li><li>• Make a booklet about 5 rules you value.</li><li>• Make judgments about data or ideas based on either internal or external conditions or criteria</li><li>• Judge the logical consistency of written material</li><li>• Judge the adequacy with which conclusions are supported with data</li><li>• Judge the value of a work or art, music, writing, by using internal criteria or external standards of excellence</li><li>• Generate criteria for evaluation</li><li>• Evaluating one's own products and ideas</li><li>• Form a panel to discuss a topic. State criteria.</li><li>• Write a letter to...advising changes needed.</li></ul>
	E V A L U A T I O N	E V A L U A T E	<b>judge</b> <b>select</b> <b>choose</b> <b>decide</b> <b>justify</b> <b>debate</b> <b>verify</b> <b>argue</b> <b>discuss</b> <b>determine</b> <b>prioritize</b>		